REBELLION IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY IN A GLOBAL PERSPECTIVE: FOCUS ON CHINA

W. Edward Ezzell DeKalb College

It is commonly noted that after the defeat of Napoleon, the ineteenth century had remarkably few international wars compared in the eighteenth or the twentieth centuries. (This, of course, is from a Western perspective. China was peaceful and prosperous in the eighteenth century.) The more significant observation is that the nineteenth century was filled with social upheaval and rebellion. While many of these movements failed in the nineteenth century, they paved the way for the great social and political revolutions of the twentieth century.

While this is generally recognized in the study of Western civilization, little attention is paid in general texts or courses to the rebellions of China in the nineteenth century that served as the background for the Chinese Revolution of this century. The

purpose of this paper is to address that oversight.

The definition of what anthropologist Anthony F. Wallace alled "revitalization movements" is useful in thinking about rebellion and revolution. Wallace defines revitalization movements a "...deliberate, conscious, organized efforts by members of a society to create a more satisfying culture. The revitalization movement as a general type of event occurs under two conditions: high stress for individual members of the society, and disillusionment with a distorted cultural Gestalt." This phenomenon appears to be virtually universal in the human experience. It was especially evident in the nineteenth century.

In Chinese history, rebellion is fairly common. In fact, it was institutionalized in the official ideology known as the Mandate of Heaven (Tian Ming) which sanctioned the overthrow of a corrupt, immoral or incompetent ruler, usually ending the dynasty. The word teming from the Book of Mencius and meaning the "lifting of the mandate" is the modern Chinese word for revolution. According to the theory, if a dynasty was in trouble, certain events would occur that would indicate that the Mandate was about to be lifted and passed on. The two main indications that the Mandate was about to be passed were natural disaster and social disorder. Both of these were very much in evidence in nineteenth century China.

The Qing dynasty was founded in 1644 and had a succession of capable regents and emperors until 1796. From 1681, when the Kang Xi emperor put down the Three Feudatories (San Fan) Revolt, until 1796, when the White Lotus Rebellion broke out, China was relatively peaceful, prosperous and very much in control of her own affairs. From 1796 to 1949, however, these conditions were completely reversed.

In examining the major uprising of nineteenth century Chimathis paper will briefly mention several uprisings, but will concentrate on the Taiping Rebellion, the Nien Rebellion, and the Muslim Rebellion of Northwest China. All the rebellions that made any headway were based on heterodoxy and were chiliastic in the

beginning.

The White Lotus Rebellion lasted from 1796 to 1804 and spread over parts of five provinces. It was based on the messiants Buddhist teaching known as Maitreya Buddhism (Mi-le-fo). The White Lotus sect incorporated into its teachings the idea of an Eternal Mother who would send the Maitreya to reign and save the faithful. The rebellion was put down with great difficulty and high cost. It was a dark portent of more cataclysmic events to come in the mid-nineteenth century. Yet another White Lotus-inspired uprising known as the Eight Trigrams Rebellion occurred near Beijing from 1811 to 1813.

The Taiping Rebellion was by far the most extensive, most violent and most costly of the nineteenth century rebellions. The basic outline of the story is known to all students of East Asia What is amazing is that this great social upheaval which took the lives of as many people as World War I is virtually unknown among people in the West who consider themselves to be liberally educated.

The central figure in the Taiping Rebellion was born Hong Fuoxiu.³ He was a Hakka from a moderately well-to-do family who lived just north of Guangzhou. Hong was able to study the Confucian Canon as a boy, and about 1828 he passed the qualifying examination and became an aspirant (tongsheng) to the shengyum degree.⁴ Hong was forced to stop his full-time studies at about approximation and take a job as a village school teacher. This job he had from 1828 or 1830 to 1843.⁵ According to the Chinese scholar Dem Siyu, he may have come under the influence of the scholar Zhu Cip. "who believed in the evolutionary theory of the three generations of the Gongyang interpretation of the Spring and Autumn Annals, and

the cosmopolitan idea in the Book of Rites." That is to say, he may have already been inclined toward transcendental and miversalist ideas within the Chinese tradition. During that same period of time, Hong attempted and failed the examination for the designant degree at least four times.

ion of

Kang

until

W25

r own

were

China.

fuslim

e any

n the

The

of an

ve the

d high

me in

spired

near

most

The

Asia.

ok the

Hong

y who

ly the

ng yuan

ut age

e held

Deng

u Ciqi.

ons of

s, and

In 1836, after failing the examination for a second time, Hong many missionaries preaching on the street in Guangzhou and excepted from them a set of pamphlets entitled Good Words to atmost the Age which were translations of sections of the Bible by the English Protestant missionary Robert Morrison. Some wares say that Hong put the pamphlets away without examining them, other sources state that he gave them a cursory examination before putting them away for a number of years.8

Hong took the examination for the third time in 1837 and filled again. This time he was so disappointed and exhausted that became ill and had to be carried back to his home village. There is fell into a trance or a coma-like state that he later claimed assed for exactly forty days. It was during this period that he had is famous visions in which he went up into heaven and saw an old man with a white beard and a middle-aged man. There are several different accounts of the visions ranging from the relatively simple in the complex. In an 1862 version of Hong's mystical encounter, for example, Confucius is arrested and whipped before God because is teachings have ruined the minds of a whole people.

Hong had new energy and power after he recovered from his liness. Indeed, according to one of the later accounts (1854), is old vital organs were replaced with new ones while he was in baven. 10 He appeared to be healthier; he was larger; he developed commanding presence. It was at this time (1837 or 1838) that he adopted the polite title by which he is known in history, Xichuan. 11 The accounts of what happened during the next six years are maflicting. Hong probably went on teaching in the village school, ht in 1843 he took the examination a fourth time and failed again. According to Deng Siyu, Hong's failure of the examination was minly due to the "corruption of the examination, and was not exessarily any reflection on his ability to compose the 'eightbreed' essays."12 At any rate, it was supposedly after this failure an the Christian tracts, on his shelf for six or seven years, were brought to his attention by a friend who noticed them. Hong read the carefully. The meaning of the vision now became clear:

stately old man with the beard was God; the middle-aged man was Jesus Christ; Hong was the second son of God and the younge brother of Jesus Christ. His (Hong's) presence on earth meant the Millennium had arrived. He had been sent by his Father restore the true religion to China and to throw out Confuciants and the corrupt Manchus.

It was at this time that Hong began publicly denouncing Confucius and smashing idols. He lost his job as a teacher and flat with his friend, Feng Yunshan, to Thistle Mountain in neighboring Guangsi province. Things moved slowly for the next few year Only a few hundred converts were made, mostly among the persecuted Hakka. In 1847 Hong and his cousin, Hong Rengan, went to Guangzhou to study the Bible under the Tennessee missionary, Issachar J. Roberts. Hong probably studied with Roberts for one or two months, then asked for baptism, but was refused. Source disagree as to why this was the case. Perhaps Roberts we repulsed by Hong's ideas. Hong and his cousin apparently baptized each other and returned to Thistle Mountain.

During the next three years the two men made many convent to their God-worshipping society, as the heretical sect was known while transforming it into the revolutionary movement known as the Taiping Tian Guo (11 January 1851). Hong Xiuchuan took the tithe Tian Wang, Heavenly King. Two of the most important convent made during the years 1847-1850 were Yang Xinqing and Xiao Zhaogui. Both were of humble origin, the former a charcoal burner, the latter a woodcutter. Both fell into trances and had vision Yang became possessed by the Holy Ghost and became the spokesman for God. Xiao became the spokesman for Jesus Christ. They were given the titles Eastern King and Western King respectively. Ultimately there were eight so-called kings (wang) in the movement in addition to Hong. 16

Taiping destruction of idols and temples apparently set the rebellion off. The accepted date for the beginning of armed rebellion is 1 January 1851. On that date the Taipings soundly defeated the local gentry-led militia in eastern Guangsi, and began their famous northeastward march through the Yangtze Valley in Nanjing and beyond. They enjoyed mostly victory (with only a few setbacks) from 1851 to 1855. Instead of pursuing their enemy northward to Beijing, the Taiping leaders (Hong and Yang mainly) first established their own capital in Nanjing. This may have been

mjor mistake, for once settled in an Nanjing, they soon began internecine fighting. Three of the Wangs including Yang, the pokesman of God, were killed along with perhaps as many as 30,000 of their families and followers. A decadent Heavenly Kingdom fell to Ceng Guofan's Hunan Army in 1864. Some sources hold that Hong Xiuchuan committed suicide on 1 or 2 June 1864. Frederic Wakeman, however, states that he died of illness. 19

While the Taipings started out as primitive, semi-Christian ammunists, they did not remain so for long. In the beginning, when their membership was between 30,000 and 100,000, they held all property in common and observed a very strict moral code, abtaining from opium, alcohol, tobacco, and sex. As the movement prew in numbers and especially after the Taipings settled in at Nanking, most of the early discipline disappeared. Private ownership of land was allowed, even protected, and most Qing administrative

procedures were left unchanged.20

Oing military organization went through major changes in the middle of the nineteenth century in order to defeat not only the Things but also the Nien and the Muslims. Qing military granization dates back to 1601 when Nurhaci, organizer of the Manchus, divided his 1200 troops into four units of 300 men each. He assigned each unit a different colored banner (yellow, white, Mue, and red). Fourteen years later as his numbers had greatly acreased, he divided the four banners to make eight. mits were assigned banners of the same four colors, but with borders around them. These then were the Eight Manchu Banners. After the Ming were defeated in 1644, there were eight Chinese and eight Mongol banners organized out of the troops who had helped the Manchus. All were cavalry units. It became apparent to the Manchus while fighting in south China that a large infantry was meded. Therefore, the surrendered Ming army was organized under green flag and became known as the Green Standard. The Qing bronded on this army in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries to maintain order in the empire. Local militia corps (monlian) were also sanctioned by the Qing government, but were and to be called up during time of emergency. The Qing were quite wary of local or regional military organization.21

After more than a century of peace, the Banners and the Green Sundard had become weak and lazy. Discriminated against by the pyernment and low-paid, they were despised by the people upon

whom they preyed as mercilessly as bandits. Lacking discipline, the imperial army simply refused to fight in the campaigns against the Taipings and the Nien. Officers sent in reports claiming victor when they had not even engaged the enemy. They retreated in the face of armies a fraction of their size.²²

In 1853 the Qing government reluctantly authorized forty-thregentry leaders to organize local militia in ten provinces. Of these only Ceng Guofan was successful. His army was not organized along traditional local militia lines, for it was based on strong personal leadership. The officers were mainly Hunan gentry, and the soldien were Hunan peasants. Ceng personally directed his winning campaign against the Taipings. Two of his generals became famou in that action and later organized their own regional armies. Hongzhang and his Huai Army, with some help from Zuo Zongrang and his Chu Army, ultimately (1868) defeated the Nien, and Zu Zongtang and his Chu Army, made up of troops mainly from Hunan defeated the Muslims in Shaanxi and Gansu in 1874 and retoot Xinjiang in 1878.

Why the word nien came to be used for a bandit gang or the name of a rebel movement remains unclear. Actually among the Nien, the word was used to refer to military units within their organization. Originally the word nien meant a twist of oiled paper that was lighted and used in a so-called "dragon dance." Nien also means "to knead" or "to pinch" as in making bread. One theory holds that the Nien "kneaded" their people together in bands that could disperse quickly when let go. The first reference to the Nienfei (bandits) was in 1797. They were a branch of the White Lotus movement, but continued to be isolated minor bands until the mid-nineteenth century. They were mainly located in the Hualte area—that is, in the provinces of Anhui, Henan, Shandong, Jiangsu and Zhili between the Huai and Yellow Rivers. The sandong of the provinces of Anhui, Henan, Shandong, Jiangsu and Zhili between the Huai and Yellow Rivers.

ď

m

During the late 1840s and early 1850s, they were joined by numerous groups such as the salt smugglers of the area, various bandit groups, and secret societies. By this time they had lost much of their chiliastic religious motivation and were mainly quasipolitical outlaw bands. They did continue some of their religious practices, and their chief leader took the rather grand sounding title, Da Han Mengzhu, Leader of the League of the Great Han They were definitely anti-Manchu and refused to shave their foreheads, an outward sign of their rebellious character.²⁸

Nien headquarters was located in the area just north of the Huai Rivers. This was an area hit hard by the drought and flooding and starvation in the 1850s. The Nien gained followers mainly by feeding the hungry. To find food they looted Shandong and northern Giangsu which had not been hard hit by natural disaster nor had the Taiping Rebellion touched them.²⁹

Earth walls and cavalry were the two main aspects of Nien military organization. Earth walls were erected around villages and made them almost impregnable. The villages also cooperated so that if one were being attacked, forces from the others could come and attack the enemy from the flank and the rear. Nien defense actics may be summed up in the traditional Chinese expression, solidifying the wall and cleaning up the fields. The Nien were also much aided by the fact that the plundering government troops were hated as "death foes" by the civilian populace. When the Nien took a city, they usually left the civilian inhabitants undisturbed, released prisoners and executed officials. 33

By 1860 the Nien possessed twenty thousand horses, they could control or plunder eight provinces with a large and effective cavalry. The Elusiveness was the main characteristic of the Nien cavalry, and from the government's point of view, the main

difference between them and the Taipings.35

e

7

Most of the Nien leaders held no degree, but many lower gentry in the conquered areas joined them. They apparently were holders of petty degrees who had little chance of advancement under the Qing, but saw the Nien as a short cut to higher status. They advisors gave the title "Lord of the Alliance" to the Nien leader and developed an impressive ceremony for him. They also drew up regulations for the government and attempted to establish a military organization similar to the Manchu Banner system.

Adult male peasants were the major source of Nien power. Deserters from government forces also joined the Nien, and captives from the plundered areas sometimes joined the cause. The Nien first tried to win over clan leaders, for they often brought the

entire clan or village into the organization.39

The Nien defeated the Qing forces sent against them for about fifteen years. In the 1850s and early 1860s, government troops made only half-hearted efforts against the Nien, but after the defeat of the Taiping in 1864 they made an all-out assault. Senggolinchin, a highly acclaimed Mongol prince and commander of Qing imperial

forces, led the attack. He was trapped and killed in 1865.⁴⁰ Ceng Guofan was defeated, though not captured, by tactics similar to those used against Senggolinchin, and the criticism that resulted forced the man who had defeated the Taiping to resign his command.⁴¹

1

fa

to

T

ρI

De

st

A

m

ex

Th

in

M

dy

M

the

ow

the

yea

def

Qin

by

nev

Ceng was replaced by his protege, Li Hongzhang, who with the Huai Army mounted a determined and well-organized campaign against the Nien. Li defeated the Nien by cutting them off while they were looting in Shandong and Giangsu. 42 Meanwhile, Li adopted some of the Nien's own tactics and granted pardons. 43 The net that had been established around the Nien was gradually tightened until the Nien were boxed into a small area near where the Grand Canal and the Yellow River meet. There the last of the Nien forces were defeated in 1868. 44

The policy that defeated the Nien was not really a policy of the Qing government. It was the defeat of one regional army by another regional army. It did not indicate the recovery of the dynasty. If anything, it indicated the contrary. The Huai Army was not disbanded, as the Hunan Army had been, and continued as a major force in North China. Further, the defeat of the Nien brought no change in Qing economic or political policy. The conditions that had given rise to the Nien remained unchanged, and as Siang-tseh Chiang has stated, "The rise, thirty years later, of the Boxers, another branch of the White Lotus, in the old Nien area on the borders of Anhwei, Shntung, Kiangsu, and Honan, testifies eloquently to this fact."

The Muslim rebellion of Northwest China which lasted from 1862 to 1878 was primarily the rebellion of an oppressed minority. The Muslims were neither trying to overthrow the Qing and replace them with a Muslim dynasty nor were they trying to revitalize the old dynasty. They seemed to have been fighting simply to save themselves from the Han Chinese and to return to the status quante bellum. For others it was a Muslim nationalist or independent movement. There were, in effect, two different rebellions as there were two different types of Muslims in Northwest China. There were the Han Hui or Chinese muslims and the Chan Hui or "turban-wearing" Muslims who were Uygurs. The Han Hui were located mainly in Shaanxi and Gansu, and the Uygurs lived in Xinjiang.

The Muslim rebellion began in Shaanxi and spread to Gansu and Xinjiang. It apparently was bloodiest in Gansu where, according to

one contemporary account, "the population was reduced from 5,000,000 to 1,000,000. .. "48 The rebellion began after the local militia, both Muslim and non-Muslim, was called up in 1862 in the fice of a Taiping attack on Shaanxi. The Taiping attack amounted n nothing, but soon the Chinese and the Muslim militiamen were fighting each other.

The phase of the Muslim rebellion that came closest to qualifying as a revitalization movement (as defined by Wallace) was the rebellion of the so-called "New Sect" Muslims in the late 1860s. The "New Sect" Muslims were nationalists led by Ma Hualong who groposed to set up a Muslim state in Xinjiang and Gasu and perhaps to extend it across North China and Mongolia.49 Ma's stronghold was at Jinjibao in what is now the Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region. The campaign against Jinjibao lasted sixteen months, from 8 September 1869 to 6 January 1871 when Ma Ma, his son, and eighty of his officials were surrendered. 50 executed on 2 March 1871,51 and the "New Sect" was forbidden.52 The remaining Muslims in Shaanxi and Gansu were finally suppressed a November 1873 when the last stronghold was taken.53

The Muslim rebels in Shaanxi and Gasu had been defeated by a Chinese regional army led by Zuo Zongtang, another of Ceng Guofan's proteges, but a large area in Xinjian remained under Muslim control in late 1873. Since the beginning of the Qing dynasty, Xinjiang had been a colony reserved for the Manchus. Manchu forces had been unable to suppress the Muslim rebels, but the Imperial government was reluctant to turn the matter over to a Chinese general. The Manchu government ultimately recognized its own ineptitude and on 3 May 1875, Zuo Zongtang was appointed Commissioner in charge of military affairs in Xinjiang. This marked the end of Xinjiang as a Manchu preserve. 54 It took Zuo three wars to suppress the last of the Muslim rebels. Xinjiang gained provincial status on 16 October 1885.55 It is today the Xinjiang Uveur Autonomous Region.

As we have seen, the Muslims were defeated as the Taiping and he Nien had been, but their defeat, as had been the case with the defeat of the Taiping and the Nien, was no great victory for the One dynasty. All three of these great rebellions had been put down by regional armies commanded by Chinese generals. The Qing ever regained control in the areas once held by the rebellions and

afterwards controlled by regional armies.

/e

The last great rebellion to occur in nineteenth century Chi was, of course, the Boxer (Yi Hechuan) rebellion. Most Western have heard of this uprising since it was directed against the foreign devils and not the Manchu dynasty. The Boxers were, at be reluctant supporters of the Qing. They adopted the slogan "Support the Qing, destroy the Foreigner" only after the first setback their cause in 1899. "Throughout they manifested a strong district of the ability of the officials to repel foreign interference in Chin and, at heart, they were always more 'anti' than 'pro' the Manch government." 56

The Boxers of 1898-99 were a branch of White Lotus Buddhis and regarded themselves as members of a much earlier Boxers and as heirs of the Nien as well. Their religious beliefs well drawn from Buddhism, Taoism, and the "folk" deities of China such as Guan Di from the San Guo. They believed they could make themselves impervious to bullets and swords by performing certain rituals including boxing (lianchuan.).

The Boxers were, I believe, a classic example of a Chine religious revitalization movement. Though the causes of China troubles were many, the Boxers believed that all China's ills would be cured if the foreign devils and Christianity could be driven or of China once and for all. They believed deeply in what the regarded as the traditional and true religion of China. For then then, the Millennium would arrive when Christianity had been banned and Chinese religion revitalized and re-established universally. The Christian devils had built their roads, the buildings, and their railroads without regard for feng shui59 and be invited the wrath of the departed spirits and of Heaven, One proper respect for the earth, for the departed, and for Heaven he been re-established, floods, drought, and pestilence would cease.

Boxer converts were often quite young, and many were former soldiers. To save money, the government had greatly reduced the size of the army, and there were literally hundreds of bands of exsoldiers roaming about looking for work and living as best the could off the land. To many of them, the Boxer doctrines made sense. The Boxers had ambivalent and even contradictory attitude toward women. Unlike most earlier White Lotus sects, the Boxen did not admit women to the sect proper, and they regarded women as unclean. They did allow and even encouraged the development of companion women's organizations, the *Hong Deng Zhao* or Ref.

Lanterns for girls between the ages of twelve and eighteen and the ging Den Zhao or Green Lanterns for widows. 61 Apparently there was no organization for married women. Unlike the men, the women and a supreme leader. 62 The purpose of the women's groups was exactly the same as that of the Boxers: to kill or drive out the foreign devil. 63

The course and outcome of the Boxer Rebellion are well known. The Qing government gave its approval to the heterodox Boxers and their undertaking; hundreds of Chinese Christian converts and a great many western missionaries were killed; the legations were besieged for fifty-five days; and finally the foreign troops (the Allies') entered Northeast China and Beijing, restored order and saw

wit that the Boxers were punished.

That the Qing dynasty would embrace the heterodox Boxer sect was simply another indication of how desperate it had become. The dynasty had lost control of China. Its power had been eroded by messianic fanatics, regional armies, and the ever-present and aggressive foreigner. The Chinese dynasty that collapsed in 1912 had atrophied in the face of unceasing conflict. The nineteenth century rebellions were not successful, but they laid open the way for twentieth century revolution which was.

NOTES

Anthony F. C. Wallace, "Revitalization Movements," American

Anthropologist, 58: (April, 1956), 279.

Susan Naquin, Millenarian Rebellion in China: The Eight Tigrams Uprising of 1813 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976), 10-11.

38. Y. Teng, New Light on the History of the Taiping Rebellion

Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1950), 50.

4Ibid., 50-51.

⁵Ibid., 51.

⁶Ibid.

ê

Albert Feuerwerker, Rebellion in Nineteenth-Century China (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, The University of Michigan), 9.

8Teng, New Light on the Taiping, 52.

9Ibid., 53.

¹⁰Feuerwerker, Rebellion, 10.

¹¹Teng, New Light on the Taiping, 50.

¹²Ibid., 54.

¹³Yuan Chung Teng, "Reverend Issachar Jacox Roberts and the Taiping Rebellion," *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 23: (November 1963), 56.

14Teng, New Light on the Taiping, 57.

¹⁵Ibid., 58.

¹⁶J. C. Cheng, *Chinese Sources for the Taiping Rebellion*, 1854–1864 (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1963), 161.

¹⁷Feuerwerker, Rebellion, 29-30.

¹⁸Teng, New Light on the Taiping, 70.

19 Frederick Wakeman, Jr., The Fall of Imperial China (New York: The Free Press, A Division of Macmillan Publishing Company, Inc., 1975), 174.

²⁰Feuerwerker, Rebellion, 29.

²¹Wen-djang Chu, *The Moslem Rebellion in Northwest China* 1862-1878 (The Hague-Paris: Mouton and Company, 1966), 9-15.

²²Siang-tseh Chiang, *The Nien Rebellion* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1954), 76-77.

²³Chu, The Moslem Rebellion, 16-17.

²⁴S. Y. Teng, *The Nien Army and Their Guerrilla Warfate* 1851-1868 (The Hague-Paris: Mouton and Company, 1961), 18.

²⁵Chiang, The Nien Army, 8.

²⁶Teng, The Nien Army, 22.

²⁷Ibid., 24.

²⁸Ibid., 25.

²⁹Chiang, The Nien Rebellion, 59.

³⁰Ibid., 132.

³¹Ibid., 69.

32 Ibid.

³³Ibid., 40-42.

³⁴Ibid., 61.

³⁵Ibid., 71.

³⁶Ibid., 50-51.

37Ibid., 52.

38Ibid., 57.

³⁹Ibid., 45.

⁴⁰Ibid., 73.

⁴¹Ibid., 74.

```
42 Ibid.
   43 Ibid., 93.
   44Ibid., 108.
   45 Ibid., 137.
   46 Ibid., 138.
   <sup>47</sup>Chu, The Moslem Rebellion, 3.
   48 Ibid., VII.
   49 Ibid., 130.
   50 Ibid., 141.
   <sup>51</sup>Ibid., 142.
   52 Ibid., 155.
   <sup>53</sup>Ibid., 146-149.
   <sup>54</sup>Ibid., 191.
   55 Ibid., 196.
   <sup>56</sup>Victor Purcell, The Boxer Uprising, A Background Study
Cambridge: The University Press, 1963), 222.
   57Ibid., 180.
   58Ibid., 238.
   <sup>59</sup>Ibid., 174.
   <sup>60</sup>Ibid., 176.
```

61 Ibid., 235.

⁶²Ibid.